| 1  |                                                                                             |                                           |  |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------|--|
|    |                                                                                             |                                           |  |
|    | COMMISSION OF APPRAISERS OF REAL ESTATE                                                     |                                           |  |
| 1  |                                                                                             |                                           |  |
| 2  | STATE OF NEVADA                                                                             |                                           |  |
| 3  | SHARATH CHANDRA, Administrator,<br>REAL ESTATE DIVISION,                                    | Case No. 2019-759, AP20.002.S             |  |
| 4  | DEPARTMENT OF BUSINESS AND<br>INDUSTRY, STATE OF NEVADA,                                    |                                           |  |
| 5  |                                                                                             | STIPULATION AND ORDER                     |  |
| 6  | Petitioner,                                                                                 | FOR SETTLEMENT OF<br>DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS |  |
| 7  | vs.                                                                                         | FILED                                     |  |
| 8  | SHELBY BRITTNANY SPRAGNO,<br>(License No. A.0006286-CR),                                    |                                           |  |
| 9  | (License No. A.0000200-CA),                                                                 | APR 0 6 2023                              |  |
| 10 | Respondent.                                                                                 | NEVADA COMMISSION OF APPRAISERS           |  |
| 11 | This Stipulation and Order for Global Settlement of Disciplinary Action (this               |                                           |  |
| 12 | "Stipulation") is entered into by and between the State of Nevada, Department of Business   |                                           |  |
| 13 | and Industry, Real Estate Division ("Division"), through its Administrator Sharath          |                                           |  |
| 14 | Chandra ("Petitioner"), by and through their attorney of record, Christal P. Keegan, Deputy |                                           |  |
| 15 | Attorney General, and Shelby Brittnany Spragno ("RESPONDENT").                              |                                           |  |
| 16 | RESPONDENT, at all relevant times mentioned in the Complaint, was licensed by               |                                           |  |
| 17 | the Division as a Licensed Residential Appraiser, License No. A.0006286-CR. She is          |                                           |  |
| 18 | therefore subject to the jurisdiction of the Division and the Commission and the provisions |                                           |  |
| 19 | of NRS chapter 645C and NAC chapter 645C.                                                   |                                           |  |
| 20 | SUMMARY OF FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS SET FORTH IN THE COMPLAINT                                   |                                           |  |
| 21 | Case No. 2019-759, AP20.002.S                                                               |                                           |  |
| 22 | 1. The Respondent prepared an Appraisal Report for property address 150                     |                                           |  |
| 23 | Desert Valley Drive, Boulder City, Nevada 89005 ("Property") as a townhouse (Form           |                                           |  |
| 24 | 1004UAD ) instead of a condominium (Form 1073UAD). NRED 000053 – 000076.                    |                                           |  |
| 25 | 2. The Clark County Assessor's website indicated the Property was a                         |                                           |  |
| 26 | condominium. NRED 000103 – 0000104.                                                         |                                           |  |
| 27 | 3. On June 25, 2019, the Respondent indicated the Property as a "condo". <i>NRED</i>        |                                           |  |
| 28 | 000010, 000019.                                                                             |                                           |  |
|    | 1                                                                                           |                                           |  |

- 4. The Respondent's report and work file provided to the Division contained no documentation to support the Contract Section of the Appraisal Report. NRED 000053, NRED 000053 000076, and NRED 000012 000050.
- 3 4

5

6

7

8

11

12

13

1

2

5. The Respondent's report provided an area size that did not match the information provided by the Clark County Assessor. NRED 000103, and NRED 000053.

6. The Respondent's report provided inconsistent C2, General Commercial Zone, classification from her summary that the Property's "highest and best use is s single-family residence, this coincides with zoning." NRED 000053.

7. The Respondent's work file failed to develop the highest and best use for a like
ownership and zoned Property. NRED 000053, and NRED 000012 - 000050.

8. The Respondent's report and work file were deficient in supporting certain value adjustments and data indicated in Comparables under the Sales Comparison Approach section. NRED 000054 – 000056, and NRED 000012 – 000050.

9. The Respondent's report and work file contained no documentation to support
the Cost Approach To Value section. NRED 000012 - 000050, and NRED 000057.

10. While the Respondent's report contained the appraisal fee of \$400.00 it failed
to provide the amount of the appraisal management fee (\$75.00) within the report itself. *NRED 000057.*

19 20

## SUMMARY OF VIOLATIONS OF LAW SET FORTH IN THE COMPLAINT Case No. 2019-759, AP20.002.S

The RESPONDENT violated the USPAP RECORD KEEPING RULE by
 failing to include true copies of all written reports along with all other data, information,
 and documentation necessary to support her opinions and conclusions.

24

25

2. RESPONDENT violated the USPAP COMPETENCY RULE by failing to competently perform the assignment as a condominium.

3. RESPONDENT violated the USPAP SCOPE OF WORK RULE by failing to
 demonstrate the necessary extents to correctly determine the Property's legal ownership.

4. RESPONDENT violated USPAP Standards Rule 1-1(a) and (c) by failing to
 support the work file and performed an aggregate of errors that demonstrated carelessness
 and/or negligence.

4

5

5. RESPONDENT violated USPAP Standards Rule 1-2(e) and (h) by incorrectly completing the appraisal as a townhouse, and failing to support the work file, respectively.

6 6. RESPONDENT violated USPAP Standards Rule 1-3(a) and (b) by failing to
7 identify and analyze data regarding supply and demand in the work file or report, and
8 failing to develop a highest and best use, respectively.

7. RESPONDENT violated USPAP Standards Rule 2-1(a) and (b) when the
report was presented as a townhouse, and the report and work file contained insufficient
information which could mislead, respectively.

12 8. RESPONDENT violated USPAP Standards Rule 2-2(a)(iii), (vii), (viii) & (x),
13 by failing to sufficiently summarize the property as a condominium and failing to provide
14 adequate summarized information within the report for her analyses, opinions, and
15 conclusions.

9. RESPONDENT violated NAC 645C.389(2)(b) by failing to provide the amount
of the appraisal management fee (\$75.00) within the report itself.

18

## PROPOSED SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

In an effort to avoid the time and expense of litigating these issues before the
Commission, as well as any possible further legal appeals from any such decision, the
parties desire to compromise and settle the instant controversy in Case No. 2019-759,
AP20.002.S, upon the following terms and conditions:

23

1. RESPONDENT does not admit to all factual allegations and violations above.

2. RESPONDENT agrees to pay the Division a total amount of SEVEN
 THOUSAND SIX-HUNDRED AND NINETY-FIVE DOLLARS AND NO CENTS
 (\$7,695.00) ("Amount Due"), consisting of FOUR-THOUSAND FIVE-HUNDRED
 DOLLARS AND NO CENTS (\$4,500.00) in fines imposed by the Division, for all violations

| 1  | as pled in the above-summarized Complaint, and the Division's pre-hearing costs and         |  |  |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--|
| 2  | attorneys' fees in the amount of THREE-THOUSAND ONE-HUNDRED NINETY-FIVE                     |  |  |
| 3  | DOLLARS AND NO CENTS (\$3,195.00).                                                          |  |  |
| 4  | 3. The Amount Due shall be payable to the Division as follows:                              |  |  |
| 5  | RESPONDENT shall make an upfront payment of \$500, with monthly payments or                 |  |  |
| 6  | \$300.00, starting sixty (60) days after approval of this Stipulation by the Commission, to |  |  |
| 7  | be paid as follows:                                                                         |  |  |
| 8  | 1st Year: \$300/month: Total: \$4,100.00                                                    |  |  |
| 9  | 2 <sup>nd</sup> Year: \$300/11 months Total: \$3,300.00                                     |  |  |
| 10 | With \$295.00 in the last month of repayment for a total payment of \$7,695.00, as          |  |  |
| 11 | being the total Amount Due hereunder. Lump sums can be made in pre-payment with no          |  |  |
| 12 | penalties.                                                                                  |  |  |
| 13 | 4. RESPONDENT further agrees to take 23 hours of the following Division                     |  |  |
| 14 | approved education courses:                                                                 |  |  |
| 15 | As relevant to Case No. 2019-759, AP20.002.S:                                               |  |  |
| 16 | <ul> <li>Not less than 7 hours of Appraising Condos, Co-Ops, and PUDS</li> </ul>            |  |  |
| 17 | <ul> <li>Not less than 4 hours of Ethics, Competence, and Negligence</li> </ul>             |  |  |
| 18 | <ul> <li>Not less than 5 hours in Work File, and</li> </ul>                                 |  |  |
| 19 | • Not less than 7 hours of Public Records, Square Footage & Real Estat                      |  |  |
| 20 | Information Crisis                                                                          |  |  |
| 21 | The 23 hours of continued education set forth herein above shall be completed within        |  |  |
| 22 | 1 year of the Appraisal Commissioner signing the Stipulation. None of the above listed      |  |  |
| 23 | education will count towards license renewal. Upon completion the education must be         |  |  |
| 24 | submitted to the Division. Within one (1) year of completing the required education, the    |  |  |
| 25 | RESPONDENT will submit (1) month of appraisal logs. The Division will select from those     |  |  |
| 26 | logs random appraisals to be reviewed for USPAP compliance, unless the Division finds       |  |  |
| 27 | additional issues with the appraisals reviewed, in which event the Division shall be        |  |  |
| 28 |                                                                                             |  |  |
|    | 4                                                                                           |  |  |

1

permitted to pursue additional investigation.

4. RESPONDENT and the Division agree that once this Agreement is approved
and fully performed, the Division will close its file in this matter and the Division agrees
not to pursue any other or greater remedies or fines in connection with RESPONDENT
alleged conduct referenced herein. The Division further agrees that unless RESPONDENT
fails to make timely payment, the Division will not bring any claim or cause directly or
indirectly based upon any of the facts, circumstances, or allegations discovered during the
Division's investigation and prosecution of this case.

9 5. RESPONDENT agrees and understands that by entering into this 10 Stipulation, RESPONDENT is waiving her right to a hearing in each matter at which 11 RESPONDENT may present evidence in her defense, her right to a written decision on the 12 merits of the complaint, her rights to reconsideration and/or rehearing, appeal and/or 13 judicial review, and all other rights which may be accorded by the Nevada Administrative 14 Procedure Act, the Nevada Real Estate Appraisers statutes and accompanying regulations, 15 and the federal and state Constitutions.

6. RESPONDENT understands that this Agreement and other documentation
may be subject to public records laws. The Commission members who review this matter
for approval of this Stipulation may be the same members who ultimately hear, consider,
and decide the Complaints if this Stipulation is either not approved by the Commission or
is not timely performed by RESPONDENT.

21 7. RESPONDENT fully understands that she has the right to be represented by
22 legal counsel in these matters at her own expense.

23 8. Each party shall bear their own attorney's fees and costs, except as provided
24 above.

9. <u>Approval of Stipulation</u>. Once executed, this Stipulation will be filed with the
Commission and will be placed on the agenda for approval at its next public meeting. The
Division will recommend to the Commission approval of the Stipulation. RESPONDENT

agrees that the Commission may approve, reject, or suggest amendments to this
 Stipulation that must be accepted or rejected by RESPONDENT before any amendment is
 effective.

Withdrawal of Stipulation. If the Commission rejects this Stipulation or
suggests amendments unacceptable to RESPONDENT, RESPONDENT may withdraw
from this Stipulation, and the Division may pursue its Complaints before the Commission.
This Stipulation then shall become null and void and unenforceable in any manner against
either party.

9 Release. In consideration of the execution of this Stipulation, RESPONDENT 11. 10 for herself, her heirs, executors, administrators, successors, and assigns, hereby releases, 11 remises, and forever discharges the State of Nevada, the Department of Business and 12 Industry, and the Division, and each of their respective members, agents, employees, and 13 counsel in their individual and representative capacities, from any and all manner of 14 actions, causes of action, suits, debts, judgments, executions, claims, and demands 15 whatsoever, known and unknown, in law or equity, that RESPONDENT ever had, now has, 16 may have, or claim to have against any or all of the persons or entities named in this 17 section, arising out of or by reason of the Division's investigations, these disciplinary 18 actions, and all other matters relating thereto.

19 12. Indemnification. **RESPONDENT** hereby agrees to indemnify and hold 20 harmless the State of Nevada, the Department of Business and Industry, Petitioner, the 21 Division, and each of their respective members, agents, employees, and counsel, in their 22 individual and representative capacities, against any and all claims, suits, and actions 23 brought against said persons and/or entities by reason of the Division's investigations. 24 these disciplinary actions, and all other matters relating thereto, and against any and all 25 expenses, damages, and costs, including court costs and attorney fees, which may be 26 sustained by the persons and/or entities named in this section as a result of said claims. 27 suits, and actions.

1 13. Default. In the event of default under this Stipulation, RESPONDENT agrees 2 that her license shall be immediately suspended, and the unpaid balance of the 3 administrative fine and costs, together with any attorneys' fees and costs that may have 4 been assessed, shall be due in full to the Division within ten calendar days of the date of 5 default. Debt collection actions for unpaid monetary assessments in this case may be 6 instituted by the Division or its assignee.

7 8 14. RESPONDENT has signed and dated this Stipulation only after reading and understanding all terms herein.

9 DATED this \Bigg day of March, 2023. DATED this day of March, 2023. 10 11 12 NEVADA DEI RTMENT OF BUSINESS & INDUSTRY REAL ESTATE DIVISION 13 14 By: SHARATH GNO 15 Administrator 16 17 18 Approved as to form: 19 AARON D. FORD Attorney General 20 21 By: CHRISTAL P. KÆEGAN, ESO., BAR NO. 12725 22 **Deputy Attorney General** 5420 Kietzke Lane #202 23 Reno, Nevada 89511 (775) 687-2141 24 ckeegan@ag.nv.gov 25 Attorney for Real Estate Division 26 27 28 7

| 1  | <b>COMMISSION OF APPRAISERS OF REAL ESTATE</b>                                       |                               |  |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--|
| 2  | STATE OF NEVADA                                                                      |                               |  |
| 3  | SHARATH CHANDRA, Administrator,                                                      | Case No. 2019-759, AP20.002.S |  |
| 4  | REAL ESTATE DIVISION,<br>DEPARTMENT OF BUSINESS AND<br>INDUSTRY, STATE OF NEVADA,    |                               |  |
| 5  | INDUSTRI, STATE OF NEVADA,                                                           | ORDER FOR SETTLEMENT OF       |  |
| 6  | Petitioner,                                                                          | DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS          |  |
| 7  | vs.                                                                                  |                               |  |
| 8  | SHELBY BRITTNANY SPRAGNO,<br>(License No. A.0006286-CR),                             |                               |  |
| 9  |                                                                                      |                               |  |
| 10 | Respondent.                                                                          |                               |  |
| 11 | The Stipulation of Disciplinary Action having come before the Real Estate            |                               |  |
| 12 | Commission, Department of Business and Industry, State of Nevada, during its regular |                               |  |
| 13 | agenda on April, 2023, and the Commission being fully apprised of terms and good     |                               |  |
| 14 | cause appearing.                                                                     |                               |  |
| 15 | IT IS ORDERED that the foregoing Stipulation and Order for Global Settlement of      |                               |  |
| 16 | Disciplinary Action, submitted by Petitioner and Respondent, is approved in full.    |                               |  |
| 17 | This Order shall become effective on the $\underline{1}$ day of April, 2023          |                               |  |
| 18 | Dated: April, 2023.                                                                  |                               |  |
| 19 | NEVADA REAL ESTATE COMMISSION                                                        |                               |  |
| 20 |                                                                                      |                               |  |
| 21 | By:<br>President, Nevada Real Estate Commission                                      |                               |  |
| 22 | Submitted by:                                                                        |                               |  |
| 23 | AARON D. FORD<br>Attorney General                                                    |                               |  |
| 24 | By: epkeigan                                                                         |                               |  |
| 25 | CHRISTAL P. KEEGAN, ESQ., BAR NO. 12725<br>Deputy Attorney General                   |                               |  |
| 26 | 5420 Kietzke Lane #202<br>Reno, Nevada 89511<br>(775) (97.014)                       |                               |  |
| 27 | (775) 687-2141<br><u>ckeegan@ag.nv.gov</u><br>Attorney for Real Estate Division      |                               |  |
| 28 | Zutor ney for Neur Estute Division                                                   |                               |  |
|    | 8                                                                                    |                               |  |
|    |                                                                                      |                               |  |
|    | 1                                                                                    | ł                             |  |